



**Legislative Assembly  
Province of Alberta**

No. 21

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

First Session

Twenty-Third Legislature

---

---

Monday, October 4, 1993

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

**ROUTINE**

**Ministerial Statements**

Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, made an announcement regarding provincial fiscal policies.

Mr. Decore, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, commented on the statement.

Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of Health, made an announcement regarding the results of the Provincial Roundtable on Health.

Mr. Decore, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, commented on the statement.

**Oral Question Period**

During Oral Question Period, Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of Health, filed the following:

Public Consultations on Health, September 7, 1993

Sessional Paper 824/93

## **Statement by the Speaker**

Last Thursday, the Opposition House Leader asked for the Chair's reasons for the Chair's ruling on a question asked by the Honourable Member for Edmonton-Whitemud. That Honourable Member had prefaced his question about loan guarantees with references to a vote by the Assembly taken the previous day whereby the Assembly refused to accept a Motion for Return relating to that subject. The Chair ruled the question out of order as it reflected on a previous decision of the House.

The decision of the Chair with respect to the question by the Honourable Member for Edmonton-Whitemud was based partly on Standing Order 23(f) which states that a Member will be called to order by the Speaker if that Member:

(f) debates any previous vote of the Assembly unless it is that Member's intention to move that it be rescinded.

The Chair does not agree with the Honourable Opposition House Leader that this authority applies only to debates and not question period. There is no such limitation on any of the grounds for calling Members to order under Standing Order 23. Reliance is placed on the verb "debates" in section 23(f). It is the Chair's view that "debates" in that sub-order is to be taken in its generic sense and not to be seen as limiting the applicability to formal "debates" and not question period. Furthermore, to give the sub-order the interpretation proposed by the Honourable Opposition House Leader would result in Members being able to continually question previous decisions and nothing would ever be taken as final.

The Chair would further refer Members to Beauchesne paragraph 411(4) which states that questions may not "criticize decisions of the House". This principle is also found in Erskine May at page 293.

Finally, the Chair would note that the Honourable Member from Edmonton-Whitemud was able to reformulate his question in such a way so as not to refer to the previous day's vote.

Now that the Chair has had an opportunity to share the rationale behind last Thursday's ruling, it is hoped that we will not have to revisit this issue.

## **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

### **Government Bills and Orders**

#### **Third Reading**

The following Bill was read a Third time and passed:

Bill 7 Alberta Energy Company Act Repeal Act – Hon. Mrs. Black

## Committee of the Whole

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of the Whole.

(Assembly in Committee)

The following Bill was taken under consideration:

Bill 8 School Amendment Act, 1993 – Hon. Mr. Jonson

A debate followed.

Mr. Henry, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, moved that the Bill be amended as follows:

by removing the following from section 6:

or a private school accredited under section 22(2)

after "board"

and substituting the following:

in which the student is resident, or in the case of a separate school district, by that which is closest to the student's place of residence

after "board"

A debate followed.

The question being put, the amendment was defeated. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the amendment: 22

Beniuk	Germain	Massey
Bracko	Hanson	Percy
Carlson	Henry	Sapers
Chadi	Hewes	Soetaert
Collingwood	Kirkland	Van Binsbergen
Dalla-Longa	Langevin	White
Decore	Leibovici	Zwozdesky
Dickson		

Against the motion: 47

Ady	Fritz	Mirosh
Amery	Gordon	Nicol
Black	Haley	Oberg
Brassard	Havelock	Paszkowski
Burgener	Herard	Pham
Calahasen	Hierath	Renner
Cardinal	Hlady	Rostad
Clegg	Jacques	Severtson
Coutts	Jonson	Smith
Dinning	Kowalski	Sohal
Doerksen	Laing	Stelmach
Dunford	Lund	Taylor (Cypress-Medicine Hat)
Evans	Magnus	Thurber
Fischer	Mar	Trynchy
Forsyth	McClellan	Woloshyn
Friedel	McFarland	

And after some further time spent therein, the Deputy Speaker resumed the Chair.

Progress was reported on the following Bill:

Bill 8 School Amendment Act, 1993 – Hon. Mr. Jonson

The following Bill was reported as amended:

Bill 5 Financial Administration Amendment Act, 1993 – Hon. Mr. Dinning

Mr. Clegg, Deputy Chairman of Committees, tabled copies of all amendments considered by the Committee of the Whole this date.

Amendment to Bill 8 (Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre) – Defeated (on division)

Sessional Paper 624/93

Amendment to Bill 8 (Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre)

Sessional Paper 625/93

Amendment to Bill 5 (Hon. Provincial Treasurer) – Agreed to

Sessional Paper 626/93

### **Third Reading**

The following Bill was read a Third time and passed:

Bill 5 Financial Administration Amendment Act, 1993 – Hon. Mr. Dinning

## **Second Reading**

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 9 Municipal Government Amendment Act, 1993 – Mr. Friedel

A debate followed.

Mr. White moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

On motion by Hon. Mr. Evans, Deputy Government House Leader, it was agreed that when the Assembly reconvened at 8:00 p.m. they would be in Committee of Supply.

## **Adjournment**

Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mayfield, moved, at 5:23 p.m., that it be called 5:30 p.m., which was agreed to, and the Deputy Speaker left the Chair.

MONDAY, OCTOBER 4, 1993 – 8:00 p.m.

## **Committee of Supply**

(Day 13 of Main Estimates Consideration)

(Assembly in Committee)

And after sometime spent therein, the Acting Speaker resumed the Chair and Mr. Tannas reported as follows:

Mr. Speaker:

The Committee of Supply has had under consideration certain resolutions of the Department of Environmental Protection, reports progress thereon, and requests leave to sit again.

The question being put, the report and the request for leave to sit again were agreed to.

## **Adjournment**

On motion by Hon. Mr. Evans, Deputy Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 10:07 p.m. until Tuesday, October 5, 1993, at 1:30 p.m.

---

Title: Monday, October 4, 1993